

**How to Cite:**

Rohayati, Y., Bangkara, B. M. A. S. A., Jacob, J., Dzauharoh, S., & Iskandar, A. (2022). Expert opinion on the implementation of e-government efforts to improve village apparatus performance in Indonesia: Opportunities and challenges. *International Journal of Health Sciences*, 6(S9), 1659–1673. <https://doi.org/10.53730/ijhs.v6nS9.12731>

# **Expert opinion on the implementation of e-government efforts to improve village apparatus performance in Indonesia: Opportunities and challenges**

**Yeti Rohayati**

Universitas Langlangbuana, Bandung, Indonesia

Corresponding author email: [yetirohayati971@gmail.com](mailto:yetirohayati971@gmail.com)

**B.M.A.S. Anaconda Bangkara**

President University, Cikarang Bekasi, Indonesia

**Jufri Jacob**

Universitas Khairun Ternate, Indonesia

**Shinta Dzauharoh**

STIA Bandung, Indonesia

**Ade Iskandar**

Sekolah Tinggi Ilmu Administrasi YPPT Tasikmalaya, Indonesia

**Abstract**--This article was to understand the implementation of review techniques, which means understanding electronic applications from top to bottom, accompanied by efforts to carry out open administration by city authorities regarding the potential for open doors and doors in Indonesia. This study focuses on optional information as a distribution that has been distributed between 2010 and 2022, considering the development of gadgets, especially the web, lately has become an outstanding issue to examine efforts to build an understanding of American public administration, especially in the network—the country in a time that is currently full of innovation. After getting the development of information and writing related to the factors of this review, the authors scrutinized it with the framework of coding information, top-down assessment, and decoding information to get a high level of importance to note the problem; based on the presentation of the results and discussion. We can conclude that using applications to increase village operators in public services has helped provide practically dynamic and transparent services.

Therefore village officials must improve their human resources so that technology-based services can be carried out better.

**Keywords**---*Opinion, E-Government, Village Apparatus, Opportunities, Challenges.*

## **Introduction**

Information technology's development has multiplied in various fields of business and governance. The emergence of information technology innovates almost all tasks and jobs that are more productive (Hapsara et al., 2017). The technology works with data access data handling for government administration in serving the public at both the primary and Village levels. Public authorities play a role in creating strategies and activities in every field by using Information Technology to support e-Government. To make public administration smooth, straightforward, responsible, and productive, the task of eGovernment is essential to develop good village administration (Omwenga, 2016). In e-Government, which is understood as government, Electronic (e-Government) is an artificial intelligence tool for information, often called ICTs for government administrative service tasks that have procedures to increase effective performance, open to the public with broad public participation. According to the release of the world body, Indonesia is only ranked 107th, far below Malaysia, which is ranked 48th, and Singapore is in the seventh position. The hallmarks of evaluating this record are the eGovernment's task in disseminating public data, access or convenience of public data, and public administration capabilities. Considering Singapore, one of the keys to the successful implementation of e-Government is the essential preparation of a fully developed data framework (Anwer et al., 2016).

With the underlying purpose of public services, the government must utilize the latest technology, which is believed to provide acceleration of public services to increase the acceleration of public immigration at the center and in the regions (Niskanen, 2017). Some things make the government believe that electronic government works to represent that government services to the public are driven for various service purposes. Likewise, community services in village government must now change considering that public services in this global era expect excellent service, everything regulated in the law, such as the 2003 presidential instruction of the republic of Indonesia on procedures and strategies for developing public services. So by referring to government policies regarding electronic implementation in every village community organization in order to be able to adapt in carrying out various public services because, since 2017, the government has provided an option for funding of IDR 4 1.15 trillion in the financial budget for ministries and institutions as well as provincial and local governments city district government for the success of electronic-based public services (Maulana, 2020).

In any case, this administration strategy has not been thoroughly carried out in the neighborhood government, so e-Government as the government leaders cannot run well. Protection from change is one of the repressing variables in the advancement of e-Government, notwithstanding different factors, for example,

sectoral self-image, the setting of data interests, absence of want to coordinate with one another, reluctance to impart data to one another, and different elements (Harrison et al., 2011). At the same time, the utilization of Information Technology will want to answer worldwide difficulties and can draw in financial backers and sightseers to put resources into the area. Moreover, with the town government, the town, as the last piece of administration in the public government structure, has the power to manage its region (independent) inside the system of the Republic of Indonesia (Shaturaev, 2021).

The development of villages, as per regulation No. 6 of 2014 concerning Villages, is a work to work on personal satisfaction and life for the best local government assistance of the town area. So, town improvement can be upheld through the idea of e-Government for town government public area associations (Atmadja et al., 2021). The execution of town government using Information Technology makes Village e-Government a vehicle for town government responsibility for administration, so a free, straightforward, and responsible government will be made. E-Government in town government is not just a question of a town site, but is a coordinated framework by data innovation to make town government more proficient and straightforward as commanded by the Village Law." Information Technology support in the town government will energize solitary information that is consistently updatable through the town device (Antlöv et al., 2016).

This exploration directly concentrates on improving an e-Government model for neighborhood government at the town level as the fundamental underpinning of public administrations to the public authority level above. The improvement of the e-Government model at the nearby government level is figured out through a well-defined course of action for data frameworks and data innovation which starts with forming a calculated structure comprising aspects of the initiative, HR, institutional change strategies, innovation, and expenses. The results are Information Technology the board, Information Technology foundation advancement, and back-end applications that can uphold government execution (Arifin., 2020).

In the ongoing time of globalization, it is not business as usual that advances in data and correspondence innovation can guarantee productivity, speed of data conveyance, moderateness, and straightforwardness, and the government is no particular case. In addition, in the ongoing time of provincial independence, it is essential to acknowledge excellent administration by utilizing data and correspondence innovation or regularly called e-government. Experts expressed that the public authority organization can foster data and correspondence innovation (ICT) in the execution of government exercises, cooperate with the local area, and empower the responsibility and straightforwardness of public specialist co-ops (Budhani et al., 2022).

In Indonesia itself, since the Covid-19 news, this infection started to spread starting from the start of last March. In light of information from covid19 go.id, the number of individuals who were emphatically presented to Covid-19 as of March 31, 2020, was 1,528, with subtleties of 81 individuals being pronounced restored and 136 individuals passing on (Mensah et al., 2020). Regarding this

information, we can notice the speed increase of Covid-19 in tainting people. It is determined that two individuals were presented with Covid-19 for the rest of March from the start of March; the infection has spread and tainted many Indonesian residents. This has turned into the public authority's anxiety in smothering the spread of Covid-19 (Japutra & Situmorang, 2021).

In reality, we can do preventive exercises as suggested by WHO. In the first place, they are keeping up with well-being so resistance or invulnerability increments, besides washing hands appropriately consistently utilizing cleanser, third covering nose and mouth with a tissue or inward upper arm while hacking and sniffing, fourth keeping away from contact with others or venturing out to public places, the fifth tries not to contact the eyes, nose, and mouth, and the sixth purposes a veil (Abdo, D., & Bobroff, M. 2021). The main thing in stifling the spread of Covid-19 is staying away from direct human contact. So that on March 15, 2020, President Joko Widodo authoritatively gave an enticement to keep away from close contact and groups by telecommuting, contemplating from home, and venerating from home to all organizations, both public and private. This has become the foundation for a few offices executing Work from Home (Arfan et al., 2021).

Fundamentally, there have been developments in innovation-based government exercises, from now on alluded to as e-government. In wording, e-government comes from English, to be specific, Electronic Government, which implies the utilization of data innovation by the public authority to give data and administrations to its residents, business issues, and different issues connecting with the government (Budi et al., 2020). In the meantime, authorities agree that e-government utilizes advanced innovation to change government exercises that plan to develop further viability, proficiency, and administration conveyance (Forman, J., & Argenti, P. A. 2005).

So the point is to expand the adequacy and effectiveness, straightforwardness, accommodation, and availability out in the open administrations. The items can be called electronic-based administrations (e-administration), such as Electronic ID cards, and on the web-based office administration frameworks, like E-Kelurahan, BPJSTKU Mobile, Mobile JKN, etc. So even though WFH is a general help, it can, in any case, run ideally (Simonofski et al., 2019).

Currently, the government of the Republic of Indonesia is determined to improve public services, especially the apparatus through village apparatus throughout the republic of Indonesia; the government sees the current phenomenon as the rapid development of technology and information, one of the efforts that can be adopted is to take advantage of the opportunities of informatics and technology in which it is a Applications that are suitable for use in improving the performance of the village apparatus are with several applications and governments that have received recognition from various experts in the field of public service technology. Based on the explanation of the problems above, the author wants to get a deep understanding of the implementation of e-government efforts to improve the performance of the village apparatus in terms of challenges and opportunities for success. So to see the challenges and opportunities, reviewing several related documents is one of the methods we will choose to answer the problems above.

## **Method**

This section will explain the implementation of the study method that aims to gain an in-depth understanding of electronic applications combined with efforts to improve public services by village officials in terms of opportunities and opportunities in Indonesia (Creswell et al., 2011). This study prioritizes secondary data in the form of publications that have been published between 2010 and 2022, considering that the development of electronics, especially the internet, has recently become a phenomenal issue to discuss efforts to increase understanding of American public governance, especially in rural communities in the era that is now full of technology. After obtaining a series of data and literature related to the variables of this study, the authors analyzed them carefully with a data coding system, in-depth evaluation, and interpretation of the data to obtain high vertical relevance to answering problems (Yardley et al., 2015).

This study prioritizes the data that we search for through the school environment Google search engine, where by entering keywords, we will get some of the data we need, and we examine it under a phenomenological approach, which is a strategy to get findings in the form of answers from several existing data. We design this study in a positive culture where we see that issues regarding Indonesian bathroom electronics are fascinating to discuss, so we describe this study in a qualitative design. These are the steps and procedures for carrying out the study to get pharmaceuticals in government implementation to improve public services for rural communities from the point of view of advantages and disadvantages (Ritchie et al., 2013).

## **Discussion**

In this results section, we will describe the results of the study and discussion of issues related to the views of experts in the field of electronics and public services in implementing government efforts to improve the appearance of village officials in providing services to the community in terms of the ease and difficulties they face when using various applications. In this section, the results of analysis and interpretation are also followed by a discussion that we got from several data related to the theme of the study.

### **E-Government and community services**

In the ongoing time of globalization, it is not business as usual that advances in data and correspondence innovation can guarantee effectiveness, speed of data conveyance, reasonableness, and straightforwardness, and the government is no particular case. Besides, in the continuous period of local independence, it is essential to acknowledge excellent administration by utilizing data and correspondence innovation, usually called e-government. Through e-government, the improvement of public administrations can be understood. Mustafa et al. (2020) expressed that the public authority organization can foster the utilization of data and correspondence innovation (ICT) in the execution of government exercises, collaborate with the local area, and energize the responsibility and straightforwardness of public specialist co-ops.

Referring to the new law number 25 of 2009 where public services, the law emphasizes that in the form of assisting the public, the government is allowed to administer government electronically (Sulistya et al., 2019), primarily as intended in the law so that the realization of a participatory service system so that state responsibility can be relied on where with electronic services the village community gets fast service, high convenience, and is transparent and reasonable. Furthermore, Article 23 paragraph 1 of Law Number 25 of 2009 concerning public services emphasizes that the government in providing services in the form of data, namely electronic-based public services, requires an information work system that is open to the public (Adjei-Bamfo et al., 2020).

So, the various rules mandated by the government to implement an information service system in which electronic or non-electronic data frameworks can be combined so that services can still be carried out by relying on emigration with targeted services. Considering today, the wider community feels the benefits of the presence of technology in daily life and public services, even in rural communities. Likewise, village leaders continue to adhere to the laws of the Republic of Indonesia, where local governments will be more flexible in carrying out various tasks and supervision so that electronic-based services for all communities can be served with an affordable system that helps public services at the village level (Aritonang, 2017).

Furthermore, the government considers the guidelines ordered based on presidential regulation number 3 of 2003 on how to provide public service assistance as part of the administration of government data systems so that the community can be helped more. Therefore, the government has prepared various products of laws regarding the disclosure of public information so that the need for services through e-government is the primary field in development to serve the people of the entire republic of Indonesia following government directives which are carried out with special monitoring so that all areas of village government services including healthy electronic services, electronic educational services, logistics services, and others so that it is clear that the government is doing community service at the village level (Yunas, 2016).

### **The benefit to the village community**

Concerning the advantages of e-government, specifically, first and foremost, lessening costs, the explanation is that through a web-based framework, managerial expenses, etc., will be decreased. Second, expanding straightforwardness and responsibility because the general population can undoubtedly access and see the degree to which government exercises have been completed (Putra et al., 2018). Third, develop public administrations because the public will have more straightforward access (receptiveness of data and interest) to public administrations without having to come to the workplace of specific government organizations. Because of the past clarification, it tends to be perceived that e-government is vital to be applied in current circumstances. Nonetheless, this should be upheld by a few things, specifically first, the responsibility of the pioneer; this is vital to help each interaction and movement of electronic-based public administrations (e-administration). This is because the pioneer or, in this situation, the coordinator or implementer of public

administrations can commit and pursue choices to offer fantastic public assistance by carrying out e-government. Second, offices and foundations, supporting offices, and frameworks are significant because electronic-based administrations will be hard to understand without these (Watini et al., 2021).

The offices and foundation are the accessibility of PCs/workstations, web organizations, etc. Third, HR, assuming the responsibility of pioneers and framework, is satisfactory. However, HR that can execute electronic-based administrations does not exist; then, at that point, this will be challenging to understand. So the capacity of HR (organization representatives, etc) is required during the time spent carrying out e-government. Accordingly, amidst the Covid-19 condition, it is not a snag for coordinators and additionally implementers of public administrations in offering assistance to the local area; however, it can progressively expand viability and productivity in broad daylight administrations (Sharma et al., 2021).

Public services in the current era of communication society have their challenges. People who are increasingly critical of their right to receive services from the government must be responded to immediately to create a conducive climate, both for the government itself and the investment climate (Sharma & Mishra, 2017). This demand requires the government to change as well as the people immediately. The challenges in public services in Indonesia are getting bigger, considering that Indonesia is still far behind other countries in providing timely, fast, easy, and affordable public services. In addition to constructing internet network infrastructure, electricity alone is still problematic. Not to mention the culture of the Indonesian people, who still prefer face-to-face services. Given the importance of promoting public services following the ideals of Law Number 25 of 2009 concerning Public Services, researchers again conducted research on public services after 2017 conducted public service research as well. In contrast to research conducted in 2017, namely research on public services to see the achievement of compliance with public service standards, research conducted in 2019 focused on public services associated with bureaucratic reform achievements (Watini et al., 2021).

Therefore, in 2019 we want to see whether Indonesia's bureaucratic reform program can change the evil face of public services so far. The research results have been reported to the DPR RI in the form of a Research Results Report and can be accessed on the website of the Research Center ([www.puslit.dpr.go.id](http://www.puslit.dpr.go.id)). However, as a scientific responsibility, researchers must also disseminate the results of their research to the broader community (Furuholt & Sæbø, 2018). In order not to repeat the research results, the writings in this book are more focused on sections that are more detailed to be discussed. The first article by Riris Katharina, "Development of Digital Public Services in Indonesia," explores the latest developments in public services in Indonesia (Malodia et al., 2021).

We link public services with digital government (e-Gov) policies that are increasingly being worked on seriously in the current government by presenting Presidential Regulation Number 95 of 2018 concerning Electronic-Based Government Systems Maulana & Bafadhal, (2020). This paper describes the various efforts made by the government in providing digital public services

through the presence of digital government. The Covid-19 pandemic that entered Indonesia in March 2020 has changed the face of public services from face-to-face to virtual patterns. Therefore, this paper requires that the Covid-19 pandemic be used as a momentum to improve public services in Indonesia by utilizing digital government. This paper recommends that the Government of Indonesia should be in a race against time to improve its digital governance. In addition to updating technology and information media, the apparatus must also be addressed (Waller & Genius, 2015).

The quality of professional human resources in running the digital government is an essential prerequisite. For this, various pieces of training can be provided to service implementers. In addition, the mindset of the apparatus is also necessary to be directed to the provision of timely, fast, easy, and affordable services (Shobaruddin, 2019). Public services and Indonesian digital government via the apparatus must be accustomed to working without being in the office. This means that the apparatus has to implement flexible working hours. Technology can provide 7/24 service. This paper is of the view that the role of the leader is still influential. Therefore, this paper encourages bureaucratic and political leaders to make a budget, policy, and innovation breakthroughs. In addition to changes at the government level (including the apparatus), digital governance requires the role of the community. Society must change following the development of digital government. To change society, the government needs to conduct socialization, present information technology directors, and mobilize people to use available information technology (Shobaruddin, 2019).

Adequate socialization is to encourage people to try various available information technology tools. Thus, over time the culture of the community is expected to change, from being happy face-to-face to being virtual. For this, the public must be given an application that can answer all public concerns, especially for asking questions or submitting feedback and complaints. The second article is the writing by Siti Chaerani Dewanti, entitled "Use of Information Technology in Improving Public Services in the Regions." This paper is motivated by the situation in several regions that have massively used information technology in running the government, especially in providing services to the community. This paper sees that excellent public services have not run consistently, especially regarding service quality in the village practice (Bhuvana & Vasantha, 2020).

Therefore, we suggest that the government continues to innovate in providing services to the community, especially at the village level. According to many governance experts in developing countries, innovation in public services, starting from an integrated service pattern, either one door or one door, requires data integration. This data integration is realized in Community Service Malls such as those run in every Village or using one application for all services, such as the "Smart Village" program. The technology observer also noted that information technology was attempted as much as possible to improve service quality and service implementation efficiency. For this reason, the government needs to consider infrastructure availability and human resources readiness. Information technology is carried out to facilitate the exchange of information. The smooth flow of communication proves that it can increase village community satisfaction

with public services, especially now in the era of demands for practical and open services (Uthaman & Vasanthagopal, 2017).

This recommends that the government as a service provider should cooperate and be open to collaboration with related parties to develop innovation and information technology systems to ensure the realization of excellent service. Regarding regulatory obstacles, the government is expected to immediately seek solutions adapted to conditions on the ground so that services are not hampered (Sandoval-Almazan & Gil-Garcia, 2012).

We can say that base on the aftereffects of the examination directed in 2019. This paper shows that the foundation of the Public Service in Indonesia, as one of the advancements in broad daylight administrations, is affected by the pioneer's responsibility factor. For this situation, the provincial head to keep working on the nature of public administration in his space (Linders, 2012). The presence of the Public Service Mall shows the public authority's advancement and imagination in creating provincial public administrations; the presence of the Public Service Mall additionally demonstrates excellent administration, described by straightforwardness and responsibility in executing public administrations. The outcome of the Public Service Mall should be upheld by qualified and sufficient HR that can ideally run the public help organization. Also, offices, offices, and frameworks are expected to help the execution of public administrations. Public Service Malls additionally show valuable open doors and difficulties in creating e-Government and advances in the Information Technology field (Boughzala et al., 2013).

We suggest that public investments be expanded so they are dynamic and IT-educated to support the improvement of the nature of public administrations in nearby states. Furthermore, this paper supports excellent collaboration between the public authority, the local area, and the confidential area, as would be considered normal to make excellent administration in government organizations (Maulana & Bafadhal, 2020); the last article was "Public Service by the Village Government: Between Concept and Reality." This paper is spurred by the discussion about whether the town government can offer public types of assistance. In this paper, Debora makes sense that the Village plays a highly essential part, particularly in public administration. This can likewise be found in the guidelines overseeing towns; it is expressed that the Village Law is planned to work on the expectations for everyday comforts of local networks and the nature of good open administrations for country networks (Sara & Saputra, 2021).

Therefore, the government must provide infrastructure assistance to strengthen village autonomy toward village independence (Maolani, 2019). More ideas also recommend that village funds received through arrangements in the Village Law must be able to be used creatively to continue to foster innovations for service delivery to rural communities. The utilization of village fund management in government and village development administration can be used for financing the village community empowerment program. The empowerment is carried out with priority in the fields of health, education, community administration, and physical development, as well as to improve the skills of villagers. The goal is that village

innovation can alleviate poverty, empower the community's economy and reduce the gap between villages and cities (Purnomo et al., 2020).

### **E-Government Opportunities**

E-Government in Indonesia low EPI score is interesting, considering that Indonesia is one of the largest internet user countries in the world. This means that the low level of community participation is not merely a problem of connectivity or accessibility but also a problem of interest and ability to use the service in question (Almarabeh & Abu Ali, 2010). The low level of public participation through e-government is essential to identify the elements the government must improve in their various e-government products. As previously discussed, Indonesia is one of the largest internet user countries in the world. According to APJII, Indonesia had at least 132.7 million internet users in 2017. This number is precisely the same as data from Internet World Stats which was updated in June 2017. The network size of internet users is the leading indicator confirming the opportunities for implementing e-government in Indonesia. In addition, the practice of e-government has also been mandated in several legal products in Indonesia. E-government is one form of implementing the current government's priority agenda, which appears in the second point of the Nawacita (Lauranti et al., 2017).

The eight publications of the UN E-Government Survey confirm that Indonesia is one of the countries with a relatively fast rate of technology adoption. This is evident from the indicators in the TII Indonesia index, where it is known that some Indonesians have more than one mobile phone. In addition, 36 out of 100 Indonesians were found to have access to a wireless internet network. Although this number is still quite limited compared to the entire population, the Indonesian government can develop e-government products that specifically target these people who are always connected to the internet (Harnovinsah et al., 2020).

### **Challenges of E-Government Implementation**

In line with the previous sub-chapter, many challenges must be faced by the Indonesian government to optimize e-government. The points below are identified based on the above findings concerning data from the eight publications of the UN E-Government Survey. The availability of infrastructure is a significant factor hindering the implementation of e-government in Indonesia. Based on the analysis of the data obtained from the UN E-Government Survey, it is known that of the three indices that determine the amount of EGDI in Indonesia, the TII index is the lowest (Alshehri & Drew, 2010).

The Digital Gap The digital divide is related to the dynamics of problems in the demographics of Indonesian society. Based on age, adults are the primary target of e-government products. However, in general, young people are a group that is more fluent in using technology. In addition, the level of education is another factor that affects the implementation of e-government (Seljan et al., 2020). According to Hargittai and Hinnant six, the tendency of e-government users to come from people with a high level of education is because they have a greater

interest in government issues than groups with lower secondary education levels (Gounopoulos et al., 2020). Differences in Interests between Citizens and Government Governments and citizens have different goals when using e-government. The government takes a managerial point of view and emphasizes the communication function of e-government in its implementation. However, the public expects increased interaction (two-way communication) with the government through e-government. In other words, the development of e-government technology has not been in line with the government's mastery of the technology in question (Cruz-Jesus et al., 2016).

Thus, the explanation of the results and discussion of a number of literature sources in an effort to answer problems related to the use of e-government applications in serving the community in an effort to accelerate public services in an era of technology and information.

### **Conclusion**

The results obtained from a series of literature reviews of eh government publications and the improvement of the work apparatus in the Village are viewed from opportunities and challenges. So we can conclude that we believe that this friend is valid because he has answered related issues and questions where; among other things, we conclude that the community is a very relevant thing to study because in today's fast-paced and open era where government services are still using an electronic approach so that the demands of the public and public services as mandated in the law can be implemented with the principle of open, practical and responsible. Furthermore, we also found that there are quite a lot of benefits that are obtained by citizens and the government when e-Government is applied, considering that today's society is also part of an increasingly technological society, people who solve their problems, their work needs rely on practical and innovative technology culture.

We also see that in addition to the advantages of using, including the advantages that Indonesia, which is one of the countries that have extensive internet users, it is time to integrate electronics into public services in order to accelerate the desired service following the agreement e-government survey for the country category. In addition to the advantages of this use, it also has limitations in an implementation where the challenge is, among others, still constrained by infrastructure considering that Indonesia is a developing country that has a vast area, sometimes areas that have not been served by internet connection according to the needs of the community. Thus, among others, the findings that have been presented are aware that this friend has many limitations and weaknesses. Therefore we sincerely hope for criticism and suggestions for future improvements.

### **Acknowledgments**

This study also pays attention to and thanks for donations and then encourages the community for the sake of colleagues for support from professional editors. We thank all parties.

## References

- Abdo, D., & Bobroff, M. (2021). Look who's laughing now: a comparative study of Maghrebi women cartoonists. In *Women and Resistance in the Maghreb* (pp. 157-185). Routledge.
- Adjei-Bamfo, P., Domfeh, K. A., Bawole, J. N., Ahenkan, A., Maloreh-Nyamekye, T., Adjei-Bamfo, S., & Darkwah, S. A. (2020). An e-government framework for assessing readiness for public sector e-procurement in a lower-middle income country. *Information Technology for Development, 26*(4), 742-761.
- Almarabeh, T., & AbuAli, A. (2010). A general framework for e-government: Definition maturity challenges, opportunities, and success. *European Journal of Scientific Research, 39*(1), 29-42.
- Alshehri, M., & Drew, S. (2010). Implementation of e-government: Advantages and challenges. Paper presented at the *International Association for Scientific Knowledge (IASK)*.
- Antlöv, H., Wetterberg, A., & Dharmawan, L. (2016). Village governance, community life, and the 2014 village law in Indonesia. *Bulletin of Indonesian Economic Studies, 52*(2), 161-183.
- Anwer, M. A., Esichaikul, V., Rehman, M., & Anjum, M. (2016). E-government services evaluation from citizen satisfaction perspective: A case of Afghanistan. *Transforming Government: People, Process and Policy*.
- Arfan, S., Mayarni, M., & Nasution, M. S. (2021). Responsivity of Public Services in Indonesia during the Covid-19 Pandemic. *Budapest International Research and Critics Institute-Journal (BIRCI-Journal), 4*(1), 552-562.
- Arifin, Z. (2020, May). Stages of Objections as Irregularities Prevention of Government Goods/Services Procurement. In *International Conference on Law, Economics and Health (ICLEH 2020)* (pp. 310-314). Atlantis Press.
- Aritonang, D. M. (2017). The impact of e-government system on public service quality in Indonesia. *European Scientific Journal, ESJ, 13*(35), 99-111.
- ATMADJA, A. T., SAPUTRA, K. A. K., MANURUNG, D. T., & WULANDARI, R. (2021). Factors that influence financial management: A case study in Indonesia. *The Journal of Asian Finance, Economics, and Business, 8*(6), 1203-1211.
- Bhuvana, M., & Vasantha, S. (2020). Assess rural citizens' satisfaction with the service quality of shared service centers (CSCs) of e-governance. *Journal of Critical Reviews, 7*(5), 302-305.
- Boughzala, I., Janssen, M., & Assar, S. (2015). E-government 2.0: Back to reality, a 2.0 application to vet. *Case studies in e-government 2.0* (pp. 1-14) Springer.
- Budhani, S. K., Joshi, M., & Tewari, N. (2022). Smart city: Holistic development approach using the ICT Paradigm—An Indian perspective. *Advances in deep learning applications for smart cities* (pp. 283-302) IGI Global.
- Budi, N. F. A., Fitriani, W. R., Hidayanto, A. N., Kurnia, S., & Inan, D. I. (2020). A study of government 2.0 implementation in Indonesia. *Socio-Economic Planning Sciences, 72*, 100920.
- Creswell, J. W., Klassen, A. C., Plano Clark, V. L., & Smith, K. C. (2011). Best practices for mixed methods research in the health sciences. *Bethesda (Maryland): National Institutes of Health, 2013*, 541-545.
- Cruz-Jesus, F., Vicente, M. R., Bacao, F., & Oliveira, T. (2016). The education-related digital divide: An analysis for the EU-28. *Computers in Human Behavior, 56*, 72-82.

- Forman, J., & Argenti, P. A. (2005). How corporate communication influences strategy implementation, reputation and the corporate brand: an exploratory qualitative study. *Corporate Reputation Review*, 8(3), 245-264.
- Furuholt, B., & Sæbø, Ø. (2018). The role telecentres play in providing e-government services in rural areas: A longitudinal study of internet access and e-government services in Tanzania. *The Electronic Journal of Information Systems in Developing Countries*, 84(1), e12006.
- Gounopoulos, E., Kontogiannis, S., Kazanidis, I., & Valsamidis, S. (2020). The impact of the digital divide on the adoption of e-government in Greece. *KnE Social Sciences*, 401–411-401–411.
- Hapsara, M., Imran, A., & Turner, T. (2017). Beyond organizational motives of e-government adoption: The case of e-voting initiative in Indonesian villages. *Procedia Computer Science*, 124, 362-369.
- Harnovinsah, H., Al-Hakim, Y., Erlina, E., & Muda, I. (2020). Effect of accountability, transparency, and supervision of on-budget performance. *Utopia y Praxis Latinoamericana*, 25(7), 130-143.
- Harrison, T. M., Guerrero, S., Burke, G. B., Cook, M., Cresswell, A., Helbig, N., . . . Pardo, T. (2011). Open government and e-government: Democratic challenges from a public value perspective. Paper presented at the *Proceedings of the 12th Annual International Digital Government Research Conference: Digital Government Innovation in Challenging Times*, 245-253.
- Japutra, A., & Situmorang, R. (2021). The repercussions and challenges of COVID-19 in the hotel industry: Potential strategies from a case study of Indonesia. *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, 95, 102890.
- Lauranti, M., Djamhari, E. A., & Zunivar, A. Y. (2017). Policy brief 07-implementation of e-government in Indonesia, what is necessary?
- Linders, D. (2012). From e-government to we-government: Defining a typology for citizen coproduction in the age of social media. *Government Information Quarterly*, 29(4), 446-454.
- Malodia, S., Dhir, A., Mishra, M., & Bhatti, Z. A. (2021). Future of e-government: An integrated conceptual framework. *Technological Forecasting and Social Change*, 173, 121102.
- Maolani, D. Y. (2019). Strengthening village and village government towards sustainable development in the framework of increasing community welfare. *JISPO Jurnal Ilmu Sosial Dan Ilmu Politik*, 9(2), 36-48.
- Maulana, R. Y. (2020). Collaborative governance in implementing e-government-based public services inclusion in Jambi province, Indonesia. *Journal of Governance*, 5(1), 91-104.
- Maulana, R. Y., & Bafadhal, F. (2020). Provision of access to information services based on E-government in the village government. Paper presented at the *Tarumanagara International Conference on the Applications of Social Sciences and Humanities (TICASH 2019)*, 219-223.
- Mensah, I. K., Adams, S., Adjei, J. K., & Mwakapesa, D. S. (2021). Drivers of government adoption amidst COVID-19 pandemic: The information adoption model (IAM) approach. *Information Development*, 02666669211010872.
- Mustafa, D., Farida, U., & Yusriadi, Y. (2020). The effectiveness of public services through E-government in Makassar city. *International Journal of Scientific & Technology Research*, 9(1), 1176-1178.
- Niskanen, W. A. (2017). *Bureaucracy & representative government* Routledge.

- Omwenga, W. O. (2016). *Factors Influencing the Implementation of E-Government Projects: A Case of Digital Villages in Dagoreti South Sub-County, Kenya*.
- Purnomo, S., Rahayu, E. S., RIANI, A. L., SUMINAH, S., & Udin, U. (2020). Empowerment model for sustainable tourism village in an emerging country. *The Journal of Asian Finance, Economics, and Business*, 7(2), 261-270.
- Putra, D. A., Jasmi, K. A., Basiron, B., Huda, M., Maselena, A., Shankar, K., & Aminudin, N. (2018). Tactical steps for e-government development. *International Journal of Pure and Applied Mathematics*, 119(15), 2251-2258.
- Ritchie, J., Lewis, J., Nicholls, C. M., & Ormston, R. (Eds.). (2013). *Qualitative research practice: A guide for social science students and researchers*. Sage.
- Sandoval-Almazan, R., & Gil-Garcia, J. R. (2012). Are government internet portals evolving towards more interaction, participation, and collaboration? Revisiting the rhetoric of e-government among municipalities. *Government Information Quarterly*, 29, S72-S81.
- Sara, I. M., & Saputra, K. A. K. (2021). Socialization of implementing good village governance and sustainability village credit institutions: Community service in the peeing Village, Tampa spring district, Gianyar regency, Bali. *International Journal of Business, Economics, and Law*, 24(4), 58-65.
- SELJAN, S., MILOLOŽA, I., & PEJLIĆ BACH, M. (2020). E-government in European countries: Gender and the aging digital divide. *Interdisciplinary Management Research*, 16, 1563-1584.
- Sharma, R., & Mishra, R. (2017). Investigating the role of intermediaries in adopting public access outlets to deliver e-government services in developing countries: An empirical study. *Government Information Quarterly*, 34(4), 658-679.
- Sharma, S. K., Metri, B., Dwivedi, Y. K., & Rana, N. P. (2021). Common service centers (CSCs) face challenges in delivering e-government services in rural India. *Government Information Quarterly*, 38(2), 101573.
- Shaturaev, J. (2021). Indigent condition in education and low academic outcomes in public education system of Indonesia and Uzbekistan. *Архив научных исследований*, 1(1).
- Shobaruddin, M. (2019). Critical factor influencing electronic government capacity building in Fragen municipality government public service delivery. *JKAP (Jurnal Kebijakan Dan Administrasi Publik)*, 22(2), 98.
- Simonofski, A., Snoeck, M., & Vanderose, B. (2019). Co-creating e-government services: An empirical analysis of participation methods in Belgium. *I am setting foundations for creating public value in smart cities* (pp. 225-245) Springer.
- Sulistya, A. Q. W., Sulistiyo, B. B., Aditya, F., Aritonang, I. D., Simangunsong, S. A., Shihab, M. R., & Ranti, B. (2019). A case study of Indonesian government digital transformation: Improving public service quality through E-government implementation. Paper presented at the *2019 5th International Conference on Science and Technology (ICST)*, 1 1-6.
- Uthaman, V. S., & Vasanthagopal, R. (2017). A comprehensive multidimensional conceptual model assesses the e-governance service quality at common service centers in India. *Proceedings of the unique collection on eGovernment innovations in India* (pp. 99-106)
- Waller, L., & Genius, A. (2015). Barriers to transforming government in jamaica: Challenges to implementing initiatives to enhance government efficiency,

- effectiveness, and service delivery through ICTs (e-government). *Transforming Government: People, Process and Policy*.
- Watini, S., Nurhaeni, T., & Meria, L. (2021). Development of village office service models to the community based on mobile computing. *International Journal of Cyber and IT Service Management*, 1(2), 189-196.
- Yardley, L., Morrison, L., Bradbury, K., & Muller, I. (2015). The person-based approach to intervention development: Application to digital health-related behavior change interventions. *Journal of Medical Internet Research*, 17(1), e4055.
- Yunas, N. S. (2016). The development of the e-government system in Indonesia. *Jurnal Bina Praja: Journal of Home Affairs Governance*, 8(1), 97-108.