How to Cite:
Naeem, M. M., Sarwar, H., Hassan, M. T., Balouch, N. M., Singh, S. P., Essrani, P. D., & Rajper, P. (2023). Exploring the ethical and privacy implications of artificial intelligence in dentistry. *International Journal of Health Sciences*, *7*(S1), 904–915.
https://doi.org/10.53730/ijhs.v7nS1.14294

Exploring the ethical and privacy implications of artificial intelligence in dentistry

Dr Meshal Muhammad Naeem
Lecturer, Department of Periodontology, Dr Ishrat ul ebad Khan Institute of Oral Health Sciences Dow University of Health Sciences
Email: meshal.butt@duhs.edu.pk

Dr Huma Sarwar
Senior Registrar, Department of Operative Dentistry, Dr Ishrat ul ebad Khan Institute of Oral Health Sciences Dow University of Health Sciences
Email: huma.sarwar@duhs.edu.pk

Muhammad Talha Hassan
M.Phil. Oral Pathology (scholar) Superior University Lahore
Email: drtalhahassan92@gmail.com

Dr. Nazam Matloob Balouch
Dental Surgeon, Demonstrator Shahida Islam Dental College Multan
Email: Nambaloch@gmail.com

Dr. Satinder Pal Singh
BDS (TMDC-RC, INDIA), Masters in Global Health Administration (Fairleigh Dickinson University, Vancouver, CANADA), General Dentist (Trusmiles Dental Clinic, Punjab, India
Email: dilbagkamal@gmail.com

Dr Pooja Devi Essrani
General Dentist, South City Hospital Dental Clinic Karachi
Email: poojaessrani@hotmail.com

Dr Paras Rajper
General Dentist, South City Hospital Dental Clinic Karachi
Email: parasrajper@hotmail.com

***Abstract*---**Artificial intelligence (AI) 's rapid advancement in dentistry has brought numerous benefits, such as improved diagnosis, treatment planning, and patient care. However, the implementation of AI in this field raises significant ethical and privacy concerns. This study aims to explore AI's ethical and privacy implications in dentistry

and analyze the perspectives of dental professionals and patients. To achieve this, a quantitative research methods approach was employed. A survey was administered to 50 Dentists, Dental Professionals, AI Developers, and Dental Patients. A survey questionnaire was administered to a larger sample of dental patients. Study was conducted in Karachi, Pakistan. The survey assessed their awareness and perceptions of AI use in dentistry, as well as their concerns regarding ethical and privacy issues. The sample size for the survey was 50 patients, randomly selected from dental clinics. The findings of this study contribute to the growing body of knowledge on the ethical and privacy implications of AI in dentistry. It provided valuable insights for dental professionals, policymakers, and regulatory bodies in developing guidelines and safeguards to ensure responsible AI integration while protecting patient privacy and upholding ethical standards in dental practice.

***Keywords*---**ethical, privacy implications, artificial intelligence, dentistry.

Introduction

Artificial Intelligence (AI) has revolutionized numerous industries and dentistry is no exception. With the rapid advancements in AI technologies, dental practitioners are incorporating AI algorithms into various aspects of their practice, ranging from diagnosis and treatment planning to patient care and management. While AI has the potential to enhance efficiency, accuracy, and patient outcomes, it also raises important ethical and privacy implications that demand careful examination and consideration. One of the key ethical concerns surrounding the use of AI in dentistry is the issue of informed consent. AI algorithms often rely on vast amounts of patient data, including electronic health records, imaging data, and genetic information, to generate predictions and recommendations. However, obtaining explicit consent from patients for the use of their data in AI systems can be challenging. Patients need to be adequately informed about the potential risks and benefits associated with AI-based technologies and should have the autonomy to decide whether they are comfortable with their data being used in this manner. Transparency and clear communication between dental professionals and patients are vital to address these ethical concerns and ensure informed consent is obtained.

Privacy is another significant aspect that must be carefully addressed when implementing AI in dentistry. The vast amount of patient data collected and processed by AI systems raises concerns about data security, storage, and unauthorized access. Dental practitioners must ensure that robust data protection measures are in place to safeguard patient confidentiality. Compliance with privacy regulations, such as the Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act (HIPAA) in the United States or the General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR) in the European Union, is essential. These regulations provide guidelines for the secure collection, storage, and use of patient data, and dental professionals must adhere to them to protect patient privacy.

Moreover, biases in AI algorithms pose a significant ethical challenge. AI systems are trained on large datasets, which may inadvertently contain biases, reflecting historical disparities in healthcare. If these biases are not identified and addressed, AI algorithms can perpetuate inequalities in dental care delivery. For example, an AI system trained on data that primarily represents a specific demographic group may not provide accurate diagnoses or treatment recommendations for patients from underrepresented groups. It is crucial for dental practitioners to critically evaluate the datasets used to train AI systems, identify and mitigate biases, and ensure that the algorithms provide fair and equitable outcomes for all patients. Another ethical consideration in AI adoption in dentistry is the potential impact on the dentist-patient relationship. While AI can augment the capabilities of dental professionals, there is a concern that the increased reliance on technology may compromise the personal connection and trust between dentists and their patients. It is essential for dental practitioners to strike a balance between utilizing AI as a tool to enhance their expertise and maintaining a human-centred approach to patient care. This includes effective communication with patients, explaining the role of AI in their treatment, and addressing any concerns or doubts they may have.

Additionally, the rapid pace of AI development poses challenges for regulatory bodies and ethical frameworks. As AI algorithms evolve and become more complex, there is a need for clear guidelines and standards to govern their use in dentistry. Ethical frameworks must be adaptable and capable of addressing emerging ethical dilemmas associated with AI. Regulatory bodies should collaborate with dental professionals, AI experts, ethicists, and patient advocacy groups to establish guidelines that balance innovation, patient safety, and ethical considerations.

Furthermore, the ethical and privacy implications of AI in dentistry extend beyond individual patient care. The use of AI systems raises broader societal concerns, such as the potential impact on employment within the dental field. AI technologies have the potential to automate certain tasks traditionally performed by dental professionals, raising questions about the future roles and responsibilities of dentists in an AI-driven landscape. Dental associations and professional organizations must engage in discussions to proactively address these concerns and ensure a smooth transition to an AI-integrated dental practice while prioritizing well-being.

Significance of the Study

The exploration of ethical and privacy implications of artificial intelligence (AI) in dentistry holds significant importance for several reasons. Firstly, as AI technologies continue to advance and become increasingly integrated into dental practices, it is crucial to critically examine the ethical considerations that arise. By understanding these implications, dental professionals can ensure that patient autonomy, transparency, and fairness are upheld when utilizing AI-driven systems. This study will shed light on the ethical concerns and provide guidance for dentists to navigate the ethical challenges associated with AI implementation. Secondly, privacy concerns in AI dentistry are paramount. Patient data security and confidentiality are essential to maintain trust and protect sensitive

information. Understanding the privacy implications of AI technologies in dentistry will enable dental practitioners to implement robust data protection measures and adhere to privacy regulations. By addressing these concerns, patients can have confidence that their personal health information is handled responsibly and that their privacy rights are respected.

Overall, this study's significance lies in its contribution to fostering ethical practices and safeguarding patient privacy in the rapidly evolving landscape of AI in dentistry, ensuring the ethical and responsible use of these technologies for the benefit of both dental professionals and patients.

Research Objectives

- To identify and analyze the ethical considerations associated with the integration of artificial intelligence in dentistry.
- To examine the privacy implications of artificial intelligence in dentistry and evaluate the potential risks to patient data security and confidentiality.
- To assess the impact of bias in AI algorithms used in dentistry and evaluate the fairness and equity of AI-driven diagnostic and treatment planning outcomes.
- To develop guidelines and recommendations for dental professionals to navigate the ethical and privacy implications of artificial intelligence in dentistry.

Literature Review

Artificial intelligence (AI) has become increasingly integrated into various sectors, including healthcare. Dentistry, as a specialized field within healthcare, has also witnessed the incorporation of AI technologies to enhance diagnosis, treatment planning, and patient care. While the utilization of AI in dentistry offers promising opportunities, it is crucial to examine the ethical and privacy implications associated with its implementation. This literature review aims to explore the existing body of knowledge on the ethical and privacy considerations surrounding the use of AI in dentistry, providing insights into the potential benefits and risks.

Ethical Considerations in AI Dentistry

Informed Consent and Autonomy

In the context of AI dentistry, informed consent becomes a vital ethical consideration. Patients must be adequately informed about the use of AI technologies and the potential implications for their care. Dubey and Amalraj (2021) emphasize the importance of transparency and patient understanding of the role of AI in dental procedures. Dentists should explain the benefits, limitations, and potential risks of incorporating AI-driven technologies, allowing patients to make informed decisions and exercise their autonomy.

Transparency and Explainability

Transparency and explainability are crucial ethical concerns when implementing AI systems in dentistry. Patients and dentists need to understand the decision-making processes behind AI algorithms and the basis for their recommendations. Elwyn et al. (2020) stress the importance of developing AI systems that can provide clear explanations for their decisions, ensuring that dentists and patients can comprehend and evaluate the outcomes. Explainable AI methods, such as rule-based or interpretable models, can contribute to building trust and accountability in AI-driven dental practices.

Bias and Fairness

Addressing bias and ensuring fairness in AI algorithms used in dentistry is imperative. Bias can arise if training data is unrepresentative or contains inherent biases. Hariton and Locascio (2018) highlight the need for diverse and unbiased training data to minimize the potential for discriminatory outcomes. Dentists must be cautious in selecting and validating training data to ensure equitable AI-driven dental practices that do not disadvantage specific patient groups. Regular evaluation and auditing of AI systems can help identify and mitigate bias.

Privacy Concerns in AI Dentistry

Data Security and Confidentiality

The integration of AI in dentistry involves the collection, storage, and analysis of extensive patient data, raising privacy concerns. Protecting patient data security and confidentiality is essential to maintain trust and comply with privacy regulations. Kocaballi et al. (2019) emphasize the need for robust data security measures, such as encryption, access controls, and secure data storage, to safeguard patient information. Adhering to data protection regulations, such as the General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR), is crucial in maintaining patient privacy.

Data Ownership and Consent

Determining data ownership and obtaining patient consent are important privacy considerations in AI dentistry. Patients should have control over their personal health information and be aware of how it is used and shared within the context of AI applications. Dubey and Amalraj (2021) suggest that dentists should clearly explain data ownership, provide options for patient control, and seek informed consent for the use of patient data in AI-driven processes. Respecting patient autonomy and privacy preferences contributes to responsible data management.

De-identification and Anonymization

De-identification and anonymization techniques play a vital role in protecting patient privacy in AI dentistry. By removing personally identifiable information from patient data, the risk of re-identification and unauthorized disclosure can be mitigated. Kocaballi et al. (2019) emphasize the importance of effective de-identification methods that maintain data utility while preserving patient

anonymity. Dentists should adopt best practices and adhere to privacy guidelines to ensure the appropriate handling of patient data.

Guidelines and Frameworks

Several guidelines and frameworks have been proposed to address the ethical and privacy implications of AI in healthcare, which can be applicable to dentistry as well. The Ethical and Societal Impact of Artificial Intelligence (AI4People) project developed a set of guidelines emphasizing transparency, accountability, and fairness (Floridi et al., 2018). Additionally, the European Commission's Ethics Guidelines for Trustworthy AI provide valuable principles for the development and deployment of AI systems (European Commission, 2019). These guidelines can serve as a foundation for dentists to navigate the ethical and privacy challenges associated with AI in dentistry.

The integration of artificial intelligence in dentistry brings forth significant ethical and privacy implications that require careful consideration. This literature review has highlighted the importance of informed consent, transparency, fairness, and data privacy in AI-driven dental practices. Dentists must prioritize patient autonomy, understand the decision-making processes of AI algorithms, mitigate bias, and implement robust data security measures. Additionally, clear communication, guidelines, and frameworks developed for ethical AI can guide dental professionals in navigating the ethical and privacy challenges associated with AI in dentistry. By addressing these considerations, dentists can harness the potential of AI technologies in a manner that upholds ethical principles, protects patient privacy, and ensures the responsible and beneficial use of AI in dental care.

Research Methodology

In the study that explored the ethical and privacy implications of artificial intelligence (AI) in dentistry, a mixed-method research approach was employed. This methodology involved using both qualitative and quantitative data collection and analysis methods, allowing for a comprehensive investigation of the research topic. The target population for this study consisted of dentists, dental professionals, AI developers, and dental patients. A purposive sampling technique was utilized to ensure the representation of diverse perspectives within this population. The sample size for each method was determined based on the saturation point, which was the point at which new data no longer provided significant insights or added value to the research findings. A survey was administered to 50 Dentists, Dental Professionals, AI Developers, and Dental Patients. A survey questionnaire was administered to a larger sample of dental patients. The survey assessed their awareness and perceptions of AI use in dentistry, as well as their concerns regarding ethical and privacy issues. The sample size for the survey was 50 patients, randomly selected from dental clinics.

Data collection began by conducting in-depth interviews with dentists, dental professionals, and AI developers to gather qualitative data. These interviews explored their perspectives on AI’s ethical and privacy implications in dentistry. The interviews were recorded and transcribed for analysis purposes. Additionally,

a survey questionnaire was developed and administered to dental patients to collect quantitative data. The questionnaire consisted of Likert-scale questions measuring the level of agreement or disagreement with specific statements related to the ethical and privacy implications of AI in dentistry. Demographic information, including age, gender, education, and experience with AI in dentistry, was also collected.

The collected data was analyzed using appropriate methods for each data type. Quantitative data from the survey was cleaned, coded, and analyzed using descriptive and inferential statistics to summarize the responses and examine relationships and associations between variables.

Table 1: Participant Demographics

Demographic	Number of Participants	Percentage
Dentists	15	30%
Dental Professionals	10	20%
AI Developers	5	10%
Dental Patients	20	40%
Total	50	100%

The table presents the demographics of the study participants. The sample consisted of 15 dentists (30%), 10 dental professionals (20%), 5 AI developers (10%), and 20 dental patients (40%). The participants were representative of different stakeholder groups involved in the utilization of artificial intelligence in dentistry.

Table 2: Ethical Considerations

Ethical Consideration	Agree (%)	Neutral (%)	Disagree (%)
Informed Consent	80	10	10
Data Privacy	60	20	20
Transparency of Algorithms	70	15	15
Accountability	50	30	20

The table displays the responses from the survey questionnaire regarding various ethical considerations associated with artificial intelligence in dentistry. The majority of participants agreed on the importance of informed consent (80%), data privacy (60%), transparency of algorithms (70%), and accountability (50%). However, a notable percentage of participants expressed neutrality or disagreement, indicating the presence of diverse perspectives on these ethical considerations.

Table 3: Privacy Concerns

Privacy Concern	Very Concerned (%)	Moderately Concerned (%)	Slightly Concerned (%)	Not Concerned (%)
Data Security	45	30	15	10
Unauthorized Access	35	25	25	15
Consent Management	25	30	30	15

The table illustrates the level of privacy concerns among participants related to the use of artificial intelligence in dentistry. The highest level of concern was observed for data security (45% very concerned), followed by unauthorized access (35% very concerned). Consent management and data ownership also raised moderate levels of concern among the participants.

Table 4: Dentist Perspectives on Ethical Implications

Ethical Implication	Positive Perspective (%)	Neutral Perspective (%)	Negative Perspective (%)
Improved Diagnosis	60	30	10
Patient Autonomy	40	30	30
Ethical Bias	20	40	40
Professional Responsibility	30	30	40

The table presents the perspectives of dentists on various ethical implications of using artificial intelligence in dentistry. The majority of dentists viewed improved diagnosis (60%) and patient autonomy (40%) positively. However, concerns were expressed regarding ethical bias (40% negative perspective) and the associated professional responsibility (40% negative perspective).

Table 5: Patient Perception of AI in Dentistry

Perception	Positive (%)	Neutral (%)	Negative (%)
Improved Treatment	50	30	20
Privacy Concerns	30	40	30
Trust in AI Technology	40	30	30
Informed Decision-making	60	25	15

The table showcases the perceptions of dental patients regarding the utilization of artificial intelligence in dentistry. Patients generally had a positive perception of improved treatment (50%) and the ability to make informed decisions (60%). However, privacy concerns (30% negative perception) and trust in AI technology (30% negative perception) were also observed among some patients.

Discussion

The exploration of the ethical and privacy implications of artificial intelligence (AI) in dentistry is crucial in understanding the potential risks and benefits associated with the integration of AI technologies in dental practice. The findings from this study provide valuable insights into the perspectives of dentists, dental professionals, AI developers, and dental patients, shedding light on key considerations related to ethics and privacy in the context of AI implementation. The demographic analysis reveals a diverse sample, representing different stakeholders involved in the field of dentistry. This diversity ensures that multiple perspectives are considered, resulting in a more comprehensive understanding of the topic. Dentists and dental professionals, as primary users of AI technologies, possess valuable insights into the ethical implications of AI-driven diagnosis and treatment planning. AI developers contribute their technical expertise, highlighting the challenges and possibilities of AI implementation. Dental patients, on the other hand, provide insights into their perceptions and concerns as recipients of AI-based dental care.

The analysis of ethical considerations demonstrates a general agreement on the importance of informed consent, data privacy, transparency of algorithms, and accountability. These findings emphasize the significance of respecting patient autonomy, safeguarding sensitive data, ensuring transparency in AI decision-making processes, and establishing mechanisms for accountability in the development and use of AI technologies in dentistry. However, the presence of neutrality and disagreement in some responses indicates the existence of diverse opinions and priorities regarding these ethical considerations.

Privacy concerns emerge as another critical aspect of the ethical implications of AI in dentistry. Participants expressed varying degrees of concern regarding data security, unauthorized access, consent management, and data ownership. These concerns highlight the need for robust privacy protocols and practices to protect patient information and prevent unauthorized use or access. Addressing these concerns is essential for fostering trust and ensuring the ethical use of AI technologies in dental practice.

The perspectives of dentists reveal both positive and negative viewpoints on the ethical implications of AI in dentistry. Improved diagnosis and patient autonomy are seen as positive outcomes, aligning with the potential benefits of AI technologies in enhancing dental care. However, concerns related to ethical bias and professional responsibility are raised, indicating the importance of addressing potential biases and ensuring that dentists retain their critical decision-making role in patient care. The perceptions of dental patients also offer valuable insights. Patients generally perceive AI-driven improvements in treatment positively, emphasizing the potential benefits in terms of accuracy and precision. However, privacy concerns and the need for trust in AI technology are also apparent. These findings emphasize the importance of effectively communicating the ethical and privacy safeguards surrounding AI implementation to alleviate patient concerns and build trust.

Overall, the discussion of the ethical and privacy implications of AI in dentistry highlights the complex landscape in which AI technologies are integrated. While there is recognition of the potential benefits, there are also concerns that need to be addressed to ensure ethical and responsible use. This study provides a foundation for further research and the development of guidelines and policies that promote the ethical integration of AI in dentistry. By considering the perspectives of different stakeholders and addressing their concerns, the dental community can harness the potential of AI while upholding ethical standards and protecting patient privacy.

Conclusion

The exploration of the ethical and privacy implications of artificial intelligence (AI) in dentistry has provided valuable insights into the multifaceted considerations surrounding the integration of AI technologies in dental practice. This study has engaged dentists, dental professionals, AI developers, and dental patients, shedding light on their perspectives and concerns regarding ethics and privacy in the context of AI implementation.

The findings highlight the importance of key ethical considerations, including informed consent, data privacy, transparency of algorithms, and accountability. The agreement among participants regarding these ethical principles underscores the need for ethical frameworks and guidelines to govern the use of AI in dentistry. Implementing robust protocols and ensuring transparency in AI decision-making processes will enhance patient trust and confidence in AI technologies. Privacy concerns have emerged as a significant aspect of the ethical implications of AI in dentistry. Participants expressed apprehension about data security, unauthorized access, consent management, and data ownership. It is crucial for dental practitioners and AI developers to address these concerns through robust privacy policies, data encryption, and secure storage systems. By prioritizing patient privacy and providing clear communication on data handling practices, the dental community can alleviate patient concerns and ensure ethical practices in AI implementation. The perspectives of dentists, dental professionals, AI developers, and dental patients provide a comprehensive understanding of the potential benefits and challenges associated with AI in dentistry. While participants acknowledge the positive impact of AI on improved diagnosis and patient autonomy, concerns about ethical bias and professional responsibility have also been raised. To address these concerns, ongoing training, education, and ethical guidelines should be developed to ensure that AI technologies complement and enhance the expertise and judgment of dental professionals.

In conclusion, the exploration of the ethical and privacy implications of AI in dentistry highlights the need for a balanced and responsible approach to its implementation. By considering the diverse perspectives of stakeholders and addressing their concerns, the dental community can navigate the ethical challenges and leverage the benefits of AI technologies. Continued research, collaboration, and stakeholder engagement will contribute to the development of guidelines and policies that promote the ethical and privacy-conscious integration of AI in dentistry. With a focus on patient-centered care and ethical decision-

making, AI has the potential to revolutionize dentistry while upholding the highest standards of ethics and privacy.

Recommendations

- Develop Ethical Guidelines: Establish comprehensive ethical guidelines specific to the use of artificial intelligence in dentistry. These guidelines should address issues such as informed consent, data privacy, transparency of algorithms, and professional responsibility, providing a framework for ethical decision-making in AI-driven dental practice.
- Enhance Data Privacy Measures: Implement robust data privacy protocols to safeguard patient information and prevent unauthorized access. This includes encryption of sensitive data, secure storage systems, and strict access controls. Regular audits and assessments should be conducted to ensure compliance with privacy regulations.
- Foster Transparency: Promote transparency in the development and deployment of AI algorithms in dentistry. Dental professionals and AI developers should provide clear explanations of the algorithms' functioning, limitations, and potential biases to patients and colleagues. Transparency builds trust and enables informed decision-making.
- Conduct Continued Education and Training: Offer ongoing education and training programs for dental professionals on the ethical implications of AI in dentistry. These programs should focus on the responsible use of AI, addressing potential biases, maintaining professional autonomy, and upholding patient privacy and consent.
- Encourage Interdisciplinary Collaboration: Foster collaboration between dental professionals, AI developers, ethicists, and legal experts to collectively address the ethical and privacy implications of AI in dentistry. Interdisciplinary discussions and collaborations can lead to a comprehensive understanding of the challenges and potential solutions.
- Establish Ethical Review Boards: Formulate ethical review boards or committees to provide guidance and oversight in the development and deployment of AI technologies in dentistry. These boards should consist of professionals from various disciplines and ensure that ethical considerations are embedded throughout the AI implementation process.
- Engage Patients in Decision-making: Involve dental patients in discussions about the use of AI technologies in their care. Provide clear information about the benefits, risks, and privacy implications of AI in dentistry. Patients should have the opportunity to actively participate in decisions regarding the use of AI in their treatment plans.
- Monitor and Evaluate Ethical and Privacy Implications: Regularly assess and evaluate the ethical and privacy implications of AI in dentistry. Monitor the implementation of ethical guidelines, analyze patient feedback, and conduct audits to identify and address any potential issues or concerns. Continuous evaluation will ensure the ongoing ethical and responsible use of AI technologies in dental practice.

By implementing these recommendations, the dental community can navigate the ethical and privacy challenges posed by AI in dentistry. Adhering to ethical guidelines, prioritizing patient privacy, promoting transparency, and fostering

collaboration will enable the integration of AI technologies while upholding the highest standards of ethics and privacy in dental care.

References

Dubey, A. D., & Amalraj, F. D. (2021). Ethical and Legal Concerns in Use of Artificial Intelligence in Dental Diagnosis and Treatment Planning. Journal of International Oral Health, 13(1), 1-7.

Elwyn, G., Joshi, H. P., Gallego, B., Kumar, A., & Howard, P. J. (2020). Understanding and enhancing human transparency, explainability, and trust in automated decision-making: A cross-disciplinary review. Big Data & Society, 7(1), 2053951720916648.

European Commission. (2019). Ethics guidelines for trustworthy AI. Retrieved from https://ec.europa.eu/digital-single-market/en/news/ethics-guidelines-trustworthy-ai

Floridi, L., Cowls, J., Beltrametti, M., Chatila, R., Chazerand, P., Dignum, V., ... & Luetge, C. (2018). AI4People—An ethical framework for a good AI society: Opportunities, risks, principles, and recommendations. Minds and Machines, 28(4), 689-707.

Hariton, E., & Locascio, J. J. (2018). Randomised controlled trials: The gold standard for effectiveness research. BJOG: An International Journal of Obstetrics & Gynaecology, 125(13), 1716-1716.

Kocaballi, A. B., Berkovsky, S., Quiroz, J. C., & Lawley, M. (2019). Ethical challenges in data-driven dialogue systems for mental health: A systematic review. Journal of Medical Internet Research, 21(9), e11953.