

How to Cite:

Ziyauddin, K. M. (2022). Sanitation, health and workers involved in traditional occupations: Nuances and concerns in clean India mission. *International Journal of Health Sciences*, 6(S4), 3710–3721. <https://doi.org/10.53730/ijhs.v6nS4.9264>

Sanitation, health and workers involved in traditional occupations: Nuances and concerns in clean India mission

K. M. Ziyauddin, PhD

Department of Sociology, School of Arts & Social Sciences, Maulana Azad National Urdu University, Hyderabad, India

Corresponding author email: ziyakm@manuu.edu.in

Abstract---The occupational structure of people involved in various traditional occupations and works in India has been a vital point of discussion for decades and centuries. The paper is out of the study on the clean India mission and how people involved in various jobs that remained their traditional occupation even after significant policy initiatives by the government of India across the country. Is caste more powerful by not allowing people to escape their caste-based occupations or their inability to rehabilitate to other new works in cities? Hope to reduce the human hands from menial jobs is one objective of the clean India Mission that demands a macro study to understand the current sociological relevance of the policy.

Keywords---sanitation, health, occupation, clean India mission, caste, manual scavenger.

Introduction

The concept of sanitation and health has never been a topic of such political and scholarly debate. The concept of sanitation and health is generally seen as an area reserved for a small number of academic and political discussions. In reality, it has become a fresh puzzle for political and scholarly discourse in contemporary India on the one hand. In contrast, the same state has made highly eye-catching initiatives on the other. Popular policy initiatives such as clean India and smart cities are two critical social domains that necessitate thorough investigation and examination of existing difficulties and questions. Although many academics argue and write about health, sanitation, and cleanliness, there is a lot of noise and protest about these issues on the surface.

This article aims to quickly grasp the intricacies and challenges of existing sociological problems of sanitation and health in the framework of policies

initiated in India, as well as to investigate the more profound complexity of the Clean India Mission in the context of smart cities. How well do we understand sanitation workers and where they fit into current policies? It will provide information and feedback to policymakers to improve the reach of government initiatives and close the gap between policy and implementation.

It is such a pioneer beginning to change the face of the urban life and infrastructural that can sustain similar to the best cities in the world. To examine with the year 2008, the concept and idea of a smart city may be new to India, but it began in a few countries in Europe and Asia. It is a different matter that the smart city project attracted enormous media attention and generated people's curiosity. It became a great idea for the political class, business groups and neoliberal intellectuals. Mega projects like the Smart City in the mission mode became a talking concept and idea during parliamentary elections of India in 2014. The present ruling party as an opposition group included Smart City Mission in their political manifesto, crafting a new discourse about urban growth and shaping life in urban or metropolitan India. The hope for this policy is relatively high, which would add to the qualitative aspects of urban life.

Because no political parties could present a plausible alternative vision for urban India, the Smart City concept was welcomed and enacted as a policy, transforming it into an instrumental policy that shifted the ruling party's political perspective. The smart city mission was hailed favourably by the business sector, which saw it as a significant economic opportunity wherein urbanisation is used directly as a site for capital accumulation. The smart city project in India appeared to be a capitalist class innovation to invest in the city indefinitely in order to create surplus value in a manufactured form. Smart city discourse, on the other hand, is disseminated unevenly and is limited to current and future mega cities. Small and medium-sized cities and towns appear to have been overlooked in the smart city debate.

Cities in India are increasingly being viewed as commodities that must be invented, manufactured, packaged, and promoted before they can sell like any other product. The involvement and dedication of privatised and corporate globals in this endeavour demonstrate that the capital has taken a critical stride in making cities the primary battlefields for accumulating surplus value. Integrating a high-tech complex with the urban landscape will create substantial value. The Prime Minister of India launched the Smart City Mission to transform the nation India in the year in June 2015. The Indian government pledged "to build one hundred smart cities by 2020 as part of the Smart City Mission. It includes regenerating existing areas through retrofitting, redevelopment, and pan-city application of specific smart solutions to existing infrastructure and developing new areas or greenfields" (Ministry of Urban Development, 2015: 5–8).

Historical Sketch of Smart City

On June 25, 2015, India's Prime Minister inaugurated the "100 Smart Cities Mission" and dedicated the plan to economic and people's growth through massive urban development through a clean India mission. The union government cabinet approved an amount of 98,000 crores rupees (US\$15 billion)

to build and demonstrate 100 Smart cities and renew 500 others in India. The Cabinet also approved a total financing of Rupees 50,000 crores (US\$7.7 billion) by allocating the fund to the 'Atal Program for Rejuvenation and Urban Transformation (AMRUT) and another 48,000 crores rupees (US\$7.4 billion) dedicated to the Smart Cities mission.

The 150 Smart cities received \$7,016 crore (US\$1.1 billion) during the 2014 budget of the Union of India (from the account of AMRUT). However, only 924 crores of the budgeted amount (US\$140 million) could be spent until February 2015. As a result, the project received just 143 crores (US\$22 million) in the Indian Union budget for 2015. Before analysing the relevance of the clean India mission, it is also essential to bring a few field data and life of the workers involved in various menial works in urban areas. This paper briefly examines a few communities of Chas town in the Bokaro district of Jharkhand state. The data is generated from the ethnographic fieldwork conducted in the area and later revised my short visit to the field in 2019 and 2021. The paper does examine the life of the communities living in the various caste-based localities, and those settlements are known by the caste they belong to.

Castes involved in menial works in the field area

This section provides details about the study area regarding administrative units and divisions. I was fortunate to be familiar with the place. I was not worried about the directions of the landscape. A brief sketch is also given about the population structure and its size. My first journey to the field destination was filled with discussions with my co-passenger about the political crisis in the state of Jharkhand. He was an active member of the youth congress in the Jharkhand wing and a native of East Singhbhum. A few passengers were not happy with our discussion, but we could not stop it until I reached Bokaro railway station. The state is not only in political crisis or governance instability; it has not shown any positive change as desired in the separatist movement for the Jharkhand.

Dalit term is used sometime to connote the Scheduled Castes (SCs) in this paper where more than one community comprises into the research respondents. Bauris, Rajwars/Shakaro and Hadis are part of the study that is examined in understanding clean India Mission. At certain point, these caste communities are also referred by their caste names that comprise the families who have been permanent settlers in the Chas town. The four settlements known by their social identity are; Bauri Cooli, Hadi Cooli, Shakaro Cool and Lamba Cooli. One does not find much academic deliberations and studies on the above mentioned communities and not even one on Chas town in the last two decades. A few known ethnographic research publications can be mentioned by Nirmal Sengupta (1980) on Bauris that was conducted in Bokaro district and the second as an intensive study by James Freeman on an untouchable's life history that got published by Stanford University Press in 1979. The most ironical reflections to the untouchables life is the blatant ignorance and deprivation in their life since last 50 years. A few major industrial establishment that began by the government of India with joint collaboration with erstwhile USSR, like Bokaro Steel Plant, did not show any significant positive impact upon local habitats. Rather they gradually turned out to be urban informal workers living in destitute and

extreme deprivation. People told in the focussed groups discussions that their fate is poverty and deprivation that came by their birth in the caste they belong. Historically, community did not find chances of prosperity and changes neither any project like Smart City Mission will bring any impact except giving similar jobs and opportunities filled with filth and dirt.

Any outsider¹ can observe how people live in sheer apathy of the policy maker and extreme backwardness without proper house, often no water to drink and bath, small hutments and kutcha houses with tiny doors. The earlier nonmetallic roads have turn out as cemented but terribly broken and with patches and holes into all the streets. In the fieldwork data, one common indicator tells the story of social exclusion and dominant forms discrimination found in all spheres of life into the above mentioned communities in the Chas town.

Bauri Cooli

The largest Dalits in urban Chas belong to the Bauri community and primarily settled in Bauri Cooli and a few other nearby settlements. They are the majority of households living there. Around Two hundred households are living in the Bauri Cooli. Muslims are the first neighbouring community that lives side by side with Bauris. It is the only east side, a small stream flow (people call it Joria). At once, a small river stream that served the whole purpose for domestic usage has not turned out to be the filthiest stream that carries separate water to large areas of Chas. It smells foul and carries dirty and harmful waste of the Chas town. Ironically a few households still use it for domestic purposes when there is no alternative to fetch water in any place.

It is incredible to witness when someone from the community dips into the water and washes their clothes, too, though this habit has gradually changed, and people have tried to own a new deep bore or handpump. During the fieldwork and stay in the field, young kids are seen playing in the Joria, having a fun time and finally taking their bath. Upon asking questions, why do people still use Joria when they know it is filthy and harmful. Hadis would say that when there is hardly any water source, Joria gives a breathing source to all the poorest Dalits. Only drinking water is made available by the government borewell at a distance of half a kilometre. All the ponds in surrounding areas have dried over the years, and the groundwater source has gone beyond their imagination. Summer is a season that takes a toll on the women's life and a few elderly spouses who have to fetch the water themselves and carry a long walk. At several points, young kids accompanied the researchers toward Joria and could witness their fun time. In the following years, it would be a drain that carries the filth of the entire Chas town. In such a situation, Clean India Mission can be a significant life changer by giving skills and training to the Dalit workers and gradually rehabilitating them.

¹ An outsider is referred to the researcher in this paper.

Hadi Cooli

Hadis, an early settler in Chas town (Bhangis/Mehtar), one of the oldest communities living in Chas²[1], engaged in menial occupations. Hadi communities live in a disgraced settlement where people do not have proper sanitation, housing, narrow streets, open drains and no adequate household electricity. In 2013, there were 50 households in Hadi Cooli comprising 300 people, including young, old, men and women.

Hadis are manual scavengers that are hereditary- transformed from one to another generation, ascribed occupation by birth in a caste and primarily involves manual labour and works with no dignity and least wages. Even new technologies have not changed their work pattern though the world has changed drastically. Hadis are one such community that looks for a change and a change that brings handsome earnings, a sense of pride associated with the work they do and a better living standard. Such feelings are everywhere shared among the people in Hadi Cooli. An ideal equitable demand is to provide dignified employment and jobs. It demands interventions at various levels to reduce the brunt upon the life of sanitation workers and help eradicate inhumane, harmful and dangerous work practices they are engaged in not only in Chas but across the country. Manual sanitation works immediately need attention to the ongoing project like Clean India Mission.

Shakaro Cooli

Another locality Shakaro Cooli would have around seventy households, located next to their Dalit brothers and sisters, Hadis. The settlement is never different than Hadi Cooli except that non Dalit visit to Shakaro Cooli who finds polluting by walking inside Hadi Cooli. A couple of tiny shops repairing aluminium utensils and also keeping new utensils to be sold are first glance in the settlement.

Though, even these shops have a different structure in its shape and size; a tiny door, quite congested room and very little space to settle down inside the shops for the customers. Many of the households are dependent upon such businesses. In the late 1990s, expansion of Chas town has deeply affected shop owners who repair and sell domestic utensils. Low caste families are poorer sections of urban Chas who usage the services of repairing pots, plates etc.

Shakaro Cooli also has a good number of Rajwar households listed into the SCs category prepared by the Census of India, 2011. They do hold few lands in the nearby areas even today, though large of them had sold it to the migrants and developers looking for use land for commercial purposes. In the surrounding villages, Rajwar are found to be populated in good number. Elders among this community do regret why they sold land into the hands of urban developers. Now the same developers do not want to sell any house and flat to Rajwar families. Rather the land and plots are being sold to migrants who would pay hefty prices. At a shorter distance of two kilometres, Cheera Chas (Cheera means oldest), now an urban ward, was a village populated by Rajwar but the demography has

² Land Records of Ramesh Hadi, Gandhi Hadi dated 1802.

completely changed. It is a mixed caste group residential areas who are mostly migrants and workers employed at Bokaro Steel Plant, ONGC and other steel plants and industries. Cheera Chas looks like a village as abandoned by everyone except the poorest families still residing their ancestor's houses.

Discussion on Dalit's Life and Occupation

The stories and narratives of Dalits in the town again bring back the discussion of how a clean Indian mission would utilise the labour of manual workers belonging to low caste, pave the way for betterment, and get a sense of dignity.

Having all this background information- it was also realised that fieldwork in this place is very tough and challenging. Once, a few community members objected to why I needed such a stay in their locality? One person asked me, "*hamni ke ki fayada bhatae tor se batiyae ke?*" i.e. "what benefit we will receive after we agree to discuss with you"? They shared that a few researchers from Non-government organisations (NGOs) and organisations conducted a few surveys, but nothing returned them. Most of them took note of the family profile, income details, the households' educational information, etc. At times, an impression is that the survey would help them formulate programmes for scholarly activity in their locality. It was told that researchers as outsiders should not mislead them and keep in the dark about their motives. Now they do not want to waste their time and not be caught up in *pardeshiya's* frauds (pardeshiyas were those migrants who came from other states, mainly from Bihar and Eastern Uttar Pradesh). The local natives (natives comprise the SCs, STs and Sadanis, i.e. non-scheduled caste groups) do not have faith in them since they belong to a different place and culture. When I inquired about the details of NGOs, they did not remember the names, persons responsible for NGOs or their addresses. A few *Bauris* caste members got angry that I should not ask about them because several people visit their locality and interact, noting down the community for their benefit. This experience with *Bauris* reminded me I would be under observation throughout my field movements rather than vice versa. Srinivas said in his field experience of Rampura that textbooks on research refer students to keep their respondents under observation (1979), but I was also under observation.

An essential aspect of the study related to new policies and project is the change that took over the years in Chas town. None of the changes brought betterment and diversities in their work; work and occupations remain the same for the present generations too. Studies on *Bauris* and other untouchables in the Bokaro region show that life and employment remain the same after more than thirty years. Hence, their polluting status is due to occupational association.

Any researcher that visits Dalit localities, people look with hope and despair. A person in attire that may impress that someone visiting their localities must be a government employee. However, local government staff dislikes seeing Dalit Cooli due to the social distance between high and low castes. For instance, even in my field, I was initially misunderstood due to my dress, a fine bag to keep the notebook, and a water bottle. It is customary in an urban setup but not in Dalit localities. This appearance left the impression that I may be a government official from Delhi. A few people in the first encounter tried speaking up in the typical

urban Hindi (I would say Hindustani) language, which was quite interesting. How I tried to maintain a low profile, I was one odd among all equals. Then I decided to wait for a few days, and gradually people will start learning about my background. At times, on a few occasions, I had to give my mobile to them because anyone could ask me to call some given number. It was not delightful because how do I give them my mobile to carry at their home. It was primarily the young boys. I also took photographs from my mobile, which fascinated the women. They would laugh when I offered to see their picture on mobile and discuss something with them. A woman requested to send a photograph taken of her entire family. A schoolboy once asked me to lend the pen I was writing, and that too when I interviewed a few youths in the evening. I could not deny it because everyone started looking at me. At times, even I felt irritated because these things were disturbing, and one would miss the nuances of the interaction process.

I also had happy moments. I was a resident of the same town, and few elders received me in good spirit. A person who worked in *Bokaro* Steel Plant was thrilled to interact with me and agreed to help me provide information about his community. It is essential to explain how I meet him. Aijaz Khan, a chemist in the locality and known to me, has a good rapport with the members of *Bauri Cooli*. It is due to the reason that many of the family members do visit his medical store when they have any health problem or illness. I met Aijaz for a couple of days and discussed my research work.

The most challenging task I ever faced in my field was explaining the purpose of my research and how it makes sense to the people studying. I often went to his medical store and sat near his shop. He would offer me a *tool* (a small chair), and I could never resist his regard. It was interesting to observe the people visiting his shop. I generally, with curiosity, tried to understand those who will ask for medicines after explaining the minor illnesses. One observation was of a female aged thirty or thirty-five who complained that she had pain in *Aedee* (lower side of feet) for two weeks, which is not allowing her to do her routine jobs. She was given a pain killer with antiseptic composition. The chemist is no less than an RMP practising in the community because neither chemists charge fees nor ask to stand in the queue. Aijaz introduced me to a boy studying in class four at the government primary school of *Chas*. This boy got scared when Aijaz was introduced. I could not catch their interaction because it was purely in *Kortha* (a regional dialect spoken by all local natives and *Dalits* except tribal groups). However, after my introduction was over, I followed the boy, and he left me at a house in the *Bauri Cooli*, i.e. *Mohalla*. This was *Hari*, a senior member of the *Bauri* caste in *Bauri Cooli*. He is the only person who tried to give education to his children in *Bauri Cooli* of his age. He wanted to educate his child, who was denied due to reasons beyond his control because at the early age of ten years, his father passed away, and no one was to take care of him. He worked as child labour in stone cutting with local contractors in *Bokaro*. On many occasions and days, he lived without food the whole day. His mother was unwell with some illness for which he could not take care. At such a young age, her mother also passed away.

He narrated the moments when his mother passed away. He could not believe and realize how it happened, he said, “ki kahiyo sir, hamar maai mor gale aar haemin

tukur tukur dakho haliye, hamar gurdawa hiil gail halo parantu kaande ke chod ke kutchun kair parliye.....maiyya ke gurda kharab ho gail halai... ee baat humain daactorwa se sunne haliye. Aar hamra kutchun yaad hau, sabhe baat bujhain parliyo to ki kahbo". His mother passed away, and he was at home. His heart was burning, and he kept crying about why she left her, without telling the reason. He does not remember more details, but the doctor told them that his mother's kidney was damaged. The kidney would be replaced, but who would bear the transplant expenses. Since he was the elder son and his father had already passed away.

I kept visiting him on a couple of occasions due to his informative interaction. He worked at a hotel near the *Chas* bus stand, and his salary was barely enough for his meals. He also worked in a car garage as a helper. The garage offered him chances to earn, apart from getting some food expenses and a salary. The saved amount was to be spent on his siblings, who were dependent on him. I was emotionally shaken when I heard that at the tender age of fifteen, he sold his house, which was located in *Chandankiyari*, a *Block of Bokaro* district and bought a small land at *Bauri Cooli*. Then he started working with a contractor connected to *Bokaro* Steel Plant. After working almost ten years as casual labour, once *Bokaro* Steel Plant agreed to recruit hundreds of labourers, he was also one of the fortunate. Things changed afterwards, and he recalls that perhaps he was the only *Bauri* Caste member who worked at the plant from the *Bauri Cooli* locality. Now there are three more individuals who are an employee of the steel plant. The narratives of Hari will be used whenever required to substantiate the field understanding.

Stigma of Sanitation Workers in context of Clean India Mission

The long-term objective for extensive city planning and development became core to the policy. The cities are considered centres whereby the growth of everyone is possible. This policy prioritises laying the basis for that long-term goal by establishing "layers of Smartness", focusing on "sustainable and inclusive growth." However, "the goal of the Smart Cities Mission is to generate economic growth and improve people's quality of life by enabling local area development and exploiting technology, particularly technology that leads to Smart results," according to the Mission paper (Ministry of Urban Development 2015: 6).

The government of India launched the Smart Communities Mission for urban rehabilitation and as a retrofitting programme to create 100 sustainable and citizen-friendly cities. The Union Ministry of Urban Development started this mission by initially collaborating with all state governments and focusing on selected cities. Moreover, this procedure has already been implemented in several Indian towns. The Smart Cities Mission aims to transform an area inside each country's 100 cities by adopting a developmental plan to create model areas in towns and cities across the country. The intention is to ripple effect on other parts of the city and adjacent cities and towns neighbouring selected towns in the Clean India mission. The communities are to be chosen based on their performance in the Smart Cities Challenge, which will pit cities against one other in a nationwide competition to reap the benefits of this initiative. After defeating other towns in

the challenge in January 2018, 99 cities got selected in the list of getting renovated as part of the Smart Cities Mission.

All the states and the union territories, except West Bengal, joined by participating in the five-year programme whereby they proposed at least one city for the Smart Cities Challenge. The towns are getting financial assistance from federal and state governments between 2017 and 2022, and the mission is expected to show results in 2022.

The debate of cleanliness as a sacred pre-requisite for a civilised society got great attention after the announcement of the Clean India Mission. Suddenly Mahatma Gandhi, father of the nation of India, became doubly important by his proverbial address "cleanliness is godliness." Still, constitution maker Babasaheb Ambedkar never agreed with the specific ideas of Gandhi related to cleaning and occupations based on caste and birth in the family. The cleanliness and hygiene of every individual in any society are emphasised. Still, the concern of people engaged in polluting occupations due to their birth in a low-caste family did not find attention.

Therefore, attention to sociological research is needed to know people's responses engaged in menial occupations, namely; sanitation workers, women in the cleaning of toilets etc. The shortage of policy gap will help to achieve the target of the Clean India Mission. Further, it is also globally true that half of the world's population is in urban settlements at various levels of cities. In a report published by United Nations, World Urbanization Prospects, 2018, it is written that from then to 2050, in three countries-Namely, India, China and Nigeria, out of the world's population growth, 35 per cent would take place in the mentioned countries as the world's urban population. India is projected to be adding a population of 416 million urban dwellers³.

The urban population of the world together increased considerably high from 751 million in 1950 to 4.2 billion in the year 2018. Regardless of its low urbanisation level, Asia comprises 54 per cent of the world's total urban population, followed by Europe and Africa, which each have 13 per cent. Northern America had 82 per cent of its residents residing in cities in 2018, the whole of Latin America, along with the Caribbean countries, they have 81 per cent urban dwellers, European countries have 74 per cent, and Oceania is the most urbanised region today (68 per cent). In Asia, the rate of urbanisation is now approaching 50%. On the other hand, Africa remains largely rural, with only 43% of the population residing in cities⁴.

Thereby, India is one of the world's nations with a significantly high number of urban dwellers and demands much more in policy initiatives for years to come. Utilising human resources through training and skill with basic know-how in technology will be the best option in the future. Many interviews in a research

³ World Urbanization Prospects 2018, The Population Division of the Department of Economic and Social Affairs, United Nations. <https://population.un.org/wup/>

⁴ Ibid. <https://population.un.org/wup/>

among Dalits; largely Safai Karamchhari/sanitation workers it is found that they do not understand how cities will bring new opportunities to them⁵.

Implementing the idea of a Smart city appeared very high and path-breaking in Indian policy spheres. A full-fledged CEO heads a mission to implement a Smart City mission that could be a joint venture, subsidiaries and having a public-private partnership for an effectual output. It begins with a partnership of centres and states by shouldering the burden in a fifty-fifty partnership. In the entire project policy, the central focus appears to create massive infrastructure for the selected urban areas and towns and show a model of urban development. The concern of sanitation workers and people's involvement do not get significant attention.

The problem of sanitation and cleaning of cities and towns in India has been seen from partially understood perspectives. Human involvement in cleaning the excreta and filth has been a crude reality of the Indian social system for several hundred years. It has kept the occupation-based inequality among various castes groups alive. A large number of low caste-born families are estranged from a dignified living environment due to their birth in a low caste, namely, Bhangis, Mehtar, Halalkhor, Hadis, Rellis, Balmiki, and so many others (Srivastava, 1997; Shyamlal, 1981, 1992; Ramaswamy, 2005; Sacchinanda, 2002; Ziyauddin, 2016, Ziyauddin, 2017).

The policy dilemma can be addressed shortly by addressing manual scavengers simultaneously in terms of training and providing current employment to such a large workforce of Indian workers. Their consideration as workers is not counted; neither industrial nor informal workers make the situation worrisome. The transformation of traditional work from one generation to another is not necessary to uplift all cast groups involved in the manual cleaning of drains and toilets. It is a policy concern and a need of the country to transform into a developed nation in all indicators. Dignity and respect are equally important to every worker despite their ranking and placement if they are counted as workers.

It is not a contemporary policy challenge. Instead, it continued to challenge the policymakers since Indian independence. Several committees and commissions did serious studies and provided recommendations to handle the inhuman involvement of Dalits doing polluting and dirty jobs as manual scavengers for generations (Barve Committee in 1949; Malkani Committee in 1960). An additional value of getting stereotyped and deep social stigma continues to be part of their society even today. A few occupational groups engaged in menial and polluting occupations are also among Muslims in some states. The study of Muslim scavengers was visibly found in practice in Hyderabad, one of the most modern cities in India (Ziyauddin, 2009).

⁵ Interviews in the Fieldwork among Bauris, Hadis in Jharkhand and Mehtar in Hyderabad, 2019-2020.

Conclusion

Smart Infrastructure, Smart Environment, Smart Governance, Smart Worker or Traditional Worker in a Smart City were all explored in this research. Public health concerns and efforts are seen in every nook and corner of the Indian state. The problems of health, hygiene, and sanitation demand intensive fieldwork (Patel, 1994). It is to be supported by many more recent studies to locate the intricacies of the lives of individuals linked with traditional vocations in India. Many have been traditional workers based on their caste and birth and have remained in the same occupation even after moving to cities.

A thorough examination of field observations reveals several flaws in the rehabilitation of sanitation employees in modern cities and appropriate solutions for dealing with menial labour to truly make cities Smart and clean. While dealing with the ongoing Smart city mission as a national strategy by the Indian government, the state's role is critically vital and requires serious involvement of all stakeholders. The trust in the policy, mutual support of the centre and state, involvement of people's needs, and ease of what kind of city can help ordinary citizens are a few significant aspects to be taken in the ongoing mission across the country. Lastly, workers who have been involved not only in sanitation but also in various occupations and jobs based in the urban settlement need the attention of the policy and research in the future. Does it cater for the need of garbage workers? Workers in various informal jobs are a few areas to be considered in the policy processes.

There is no shortage of argumentation, and this note is far from complete. However, there is still plenty of room for divergent viewpoints and knowledge fusion to disentangle the issue of health, hygiene, and sanitation, which could be a possible solution to India's crisis in urban and rural life, particularly for those who are stakeholders in India. It is necessary to do research from various social science disciplines involved in this debate and topic. Health, sanitation, and the lives of people in India who work in the traditional vocation of cleaning manholes, sewers, and toilets must be investigated as interrelated threads. Otherwise, it will be challenging to comprehend the current policies on the Clean India Mission.

References

- Acharya, Sanghmitra and Ziyauddin, K M. 2001. THE DALIT QUESTION Some Concerns about Work and Health. *International Journal of Rural Studies*. Middlesex, U.K., Vol. 12, No 2, October. ISSN No. 1023-2001 (Page 27-30).
- Acharya, Sanghmitra. 2017. Historically Excluded Groups in India: Sanitation Workers and Realities of Livelihoods, Health and Safety. *Indian Journal of Social Work*.
https://www.academia.edu/53141192/THE_DALIT_QUESTION_Some_Concerns_about_Work_and_Health
- Barve, V. N. 1949. *Scavengers' Living Conditions Enquiry Committee*. Bombay: Government of Maharashtra
- Freeman, James. 1979. *Untouchable: An Indian Life History*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.

- Malkani (1960). Report of the Scavenging Conditions Enquiry Committee. New Delhi : Ministry of Home Affairs Central Advisory Board For Harijan Welfare.
- Massey, James. 1997. *Down Trodden: The Struggle of India's Dalits for Identity, Solidarity and Liberation*. Geneva: WCC Publications.
- Nyandra, M., Suryasa, W. (2018). Holistic approach to help sexual dysfunction. *Eurasian Journal of Analytical Chemistry*, 13(3), pp. 207–212.
- Patel, Tulsi. 1994, 2004. *'Fertility Behaviour: population and society in a Rajasthan village'*, New Delhi: Oxford University Press. p.229.
- Primadewi, K., & Biomi, A. A. (2021). Effect of occupational health safety on medical staff performance in Bali Royal Hospital Denpasar. *International Journal of Health & Medical Sciences*, 4(1), 141-144. <https://doi.org/10.31295/ijhms.v4n1.1642>
- Ramaswamy, Geeta. 2005. *India Stinking: Manual Scavenging in Andhra Pradesh and their Work*. Chennai: Navayana.
- Sachchidananda. 2002. *People at the Bottom: A Portrait of Scavengers*. New Delhi: Concept Publications.
- Sengupta, Nirmal. 1980. *Destitutes and Development: A Study of the Bauri Community in the Bokaro Region*. New Delhi: Concept Publishing Company.
- Shyamlal. 1992. *The Bhangi: A Sweeper Caste Its' Socio-economic Portraits with Special Reference to Jodhpur City*. Bombay: Popular Prakashan.
- Shyamlal. 1981. The Occupational Mobility among Urban Bhangis. *Eastern Anthropologist*. 11 (1): 11-20.
- Srivastav, B N. 1997. *Manual Scavenging in India: A Disgrace to the Country*. New Delhi: Concept Publishing Company. Srivastava, Vinay Kumar. (ed.) 2004. *Methodology and Fieldwork*. New Delhi: Oxford University Press.
- Ziyauddin, K.M. 2016. Occupation and Dignity of Unseen Population: Yes They Are Manual Scavenger. *Journal of Exclusion Studies*. Vol. 6 No. 2, August 2016, 125-140. DOI: 10.5958/2231-4555.2016.00010.3
- Ziyauddin, K.M. 2017. Experiencing Exclusion among Dalits: A Sociological Study of Bauris and Hadis. Volume-2, Issue-2, February, Paper-9. Pp. 29-41.